

CAUSES AND EFFECTS OF THE THREATENED WHITE IDENTITY IN 21ST CENTURY AMERICA: THE IMPACT OF SHIFTING US RACIAL DEMOGRAPHICS

Winkie Chan

Research Scholars Program, Harvard Student Agencies, In collaboration with Learn with Leaders

ABSTRACT

Historically, non-Hispanic White Americans have constituted the predominant racial demographic in the United States, wielding considerable influence in societal, political, and cultural spheres. However, projections indicate that by approximately 2042, the U.S. will transition to a majority-minority population, signaling the end of a non-Hispanic White majority. This demographic shift has engendered social anxieties among White Americans, often perceived as a challenge to their longstanding systemic power and cultural dominance. This paper examines the phenomenon of White backlash in the 21st century, analyzing how the prospect of a diversifying population impacts White identity. The findings identify three primary reactionary responses among threatened White Americans: (a) anti-minority outgroup bias; (b) pro-White ingroup defensiveness, frequently manifesting as efforts to maintain societal status through radical measures; and (c) alignment with conservative political ideologies characterized by reduced cultural tolerance. The study underscores the urgent need for targeted strategies to address the increasingly fragile and volatile racial dynamics in contemporary America.

KEYWORDS: Shifting Racial Demographics, Non-Hispanic White Majority, Majority-Minority Population, White Backlash, Racial Tensions, Anti-Minority Bias

INTRODUCTION

"To those accustomed to privilege, equality feels like oppression."

As of today, nearly 40% of the U.S. population comprises people of color (PoC), encompassing Black, Asian, Latino, and other racially minoritized groups (Pérez, 2021). Projections from the U.S. Census Bureau (2008) forecast that by 2042, the nation will transition to a "majority-minority" status, with racial minority populations outnumbering non-Hispanic White Americans. While this demographic shift has been celebrated by some scholars and citizens as a marker of progress, empirical studies reveal that many White Americans perceive it as a threat to their longstanding status as the dominant racial group (Craig & Richeson, 2014a). Historically, White Americans have held significant systemic power and prestige, often at the expense of PoC (Sidanius & Pratto, 1999).

Thus, this paper explores White responses to the perceived growth of minority groups and examines the consequences for racial progress in the United States. It aims to investigate the role of shifting racial demographics in fostering a sense of threat among White Americans and to analyze their responses within the broader context of White privilege versus racial empowerment. The findings provide critical insights into the implications of these dynamics for the future of racial relations in the U.S.

METHODOLOGY

This paper employs a diverse range of media sources—including interviews, newspapers, websites, journals, and books—to

construct a comprehensive analysis of the relationship between White American identity and shifting racial demographics. To ensure relevance to real-world contexts, the author deliberately incorporated perspectives and analyses from both scholarly and non-scholarly sources. Notably, the inclusion of non-scholarly sources focuses on contributions from reputable educational and broadcast organizations, such as Learning with Justice, CNN, Missouri Independent, and Politico.

To maintain credibility, the author implemented measures to validate claims made by independent entities. These measures included verifying the credentials and affiliations of contributors (e.g., academic qualifications, prior engagement with the subject matter), assessing potential biases or conflicts of interest (e.g., racial/ethnic background, political affiliations), and cross-referencing claims with authoritative academic or governmental sources, such as peer-reviewed journals, non-profit think tanks, and federal surveys.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION Defining Whiteness

The term "White" is conventionally used to describe a racial category encompassing individuals of European ancestry. In the context of White American identity, an additional criterion applies: U.S. federal government agencies define individuals as White if they self-identify as racially White and ethnically non-Hispanic (Poston & Sáenz, 2017).

The Formation of a 'White America'

When the United States was established in 1776, Whites comprised approximately 80% of the population. By 1920,

Copyright® 2024, IERJ. This open-access article is published under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License which permits Share (copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format) and Adapt (remix, transform, and build upon the material) under the Attribution-NonCommercial terms.

this share had risen to 90%, where it remained until 1950 (Poston & Bouvier, 2017). In 2022, White non-Hispanics were still the largest racial demographic, making up 58.9% of the population (USA Facts, 2022). The numerical majority of Whites in the U.S. can be attributed to historical patterns of European-dominant immigration. Two of the country's three major waves of immigration were predominantly European in origin: (1) the Northern European Wave (1840-1889), during which approximately 90% of total U.S. immigration came from Europe, with around 80% originating from North/West Europe; and (2) the Southern/Eastern Europe Wave (1890-1919), where roughly 90% of total U.S. immigration originated from Europe, with nearly 60% from South/East Europe (Moslimani & Passel, 2024).

However, defining White American identity solely in hereditary terms is insufficient. To comprehend how Whiteness became synonymous with societal dominance in the U.S., it is important to consider the historical context. When the first Africans arrived in the newly established colony of Virginia in 1619, "there were no 'White' people"; colonial records indicate that the legal distinction between "Black" and "White" was not formalized until sixty years later following Bacon's Rebellion of 1676-1677. As a result, individuals of African descent were bound to hereditary slavery, while poor indentured White servants and farmers were granted new rights and status. European colonial authority thus constructed the American White race, providing superior treatment to its members—whether rich or poor—and differentiating power not by wealth but by skin color. Socially, White settlers were elevated as a distinct class with greater freedom, power, and mobility. Their early involvement in policy-making and governance allowed Whites to establish a self-serving societal framework that would persist over time.

The Contemporary Identity of White Americans

White Americans are privileged. While other non-White minority groups face systemic and structural racism—forms of discrimination "so embedded that [they] often [are] assumed to reflect the natural, inevitable order of things" (Braveman et al., 2022)—White Americans are beneficiaries of these systems. In "White Privilege, Unpacking the Invisible Knapsack" (1989), Peggy McIntosh describes how racism is often taught as "individual acts of meanness" that disadvantage others, yet the systemic forces conferring White dominance are overlooked. One of the key aspects of this dominance is white privilege, referring to unearned power conferred through systemic mechanisms, which contributes to the racial disparities between White Americans and non-White minorities.

White privilege propounds that White Americans are more likely to succeed. According to the Economic Policy Institute (2022), Black, Hispanic, and Alaska Native (AIAN) individuals experience significantly higher incarceration rates and unemployment compared to Whites, regardless of educational attainment levels. Furthermore, research by Bowdler & Harris (2022) found that people of color—Blacks, Hispanics, and American Indians/Alaska Natives—are more likely to be overrepresented in high-poverty neighborhoods, less likely to earn a bachelor's degree, and have considerably lower earnings

than White adults. This unequal distribution of resources, power, and economic opportunity in American society is largely attributed to policies that hinder minority access to critical areas such as the labor market, housing, and infrastructure, as well as the overrepresentation of Whites in positions of power across political, economic, and cultural dimensions (Bowdler & Harris, 2022; Collins, 2018).

Moreover, white privilege extends beyond individual gain to encompass societal norms and practices. White individuals benefit from a framework where Whiteness is the standard in American society. Public spaces and goods often cater to White norms—such as "flesh-colored" Band-Aids that reflect only White skin tones or grocery stores stocking food options reflective of predominantly White cultural traditions. As a result, White Americans are seen as the prototypical Americans, and their identity becomes synonymous with that of the broader U.S. society (Collins, 2018). McIntosh (1989) notes that Whites are taught to view their lives as morally neutral, normative, and average, but in reality, they form the ideal norm that non-White minorities continuously struggle to meet.

Demographic Changes to the US White Majority

For the first time in history, the 2020 Census revealed a declining non-Hispanic White population that identified with a single race. Between 2010 and 2020, this population decreased by approximately 3%, or about 5.1 million individuals (Krogstad et al., 2021). The decline was widespread across 35 states, indicating a significant demographic shift.

Three primary causes have been identified for this decline. Firstly, White births are being outnumbered by minority births. White women, on average, have 1.7 children over their lifetimes, compared to Latina women who average 2.2 children (Poston & Bouvier, 2017). The total fertility rates (TFRs) for Blacks, Asians, and American Indians fall in between, meaning that White births are at the lowest end of the scale. Secondly, higher mortality rates are associated with the aging White population. In 2019, only 10% of racial and ethnic minority populations were aged 65 and older, compared to 21% of the non-Hispanic White population (Administration for Community Living, 2020). Thirdly, U.S. immigrant populations are increasingly originating from non-White countries. In 2022, single-race Asians represented the largest racial demographic among U.S. immigrants (Batalova, 2024). During the same year, Europeans comprised only 10% of the 46.2 million immigrants residing in the United States, whereas individuals from the Americas and Asia accounted for 52% and 31%, respectively (Oyolola & Batalova, 2024).

According to projections by the U.S. Census Bureau (2008), the non-Hispanic White population is expected to fall below 50% by the year 2042. After 2042, the United States will be recognized as a majority-minority country, where more than half of the population will consist of non-White minorities.

Predicting White Response to Majority-Minority

Longstanding theoretical work posits minority group size as a common proxy for estimating its political and economic power;

larger or growing minority groups are seen to elicit feelings of threat in the dominant majority (Craig et al., 2017). It can be claimed that as non-White minorities grow in numbers, White Americans perceive a simultaneous growth in power and an imminent threat to the societal structure that currently benefits them. As previously identified, the White American identity and its associated privileges rest upon the dominant White ownership of political, institutional, and economic power in society. A non-White majority, with increasing "political and economic power," therefore challenges the White American identity and status.

In recent experimental work, the prospect of a majority-minority US population has induced threat responses from White Americans, who prominently display more in-group protective and out-group antagonistic attitudes. For instance, White Americans who read an article portraying a future in which their racial group will compose less than 50% of the national population (vs. various control conditions) were more likely to perceive that Whites' societal status is under threat, leading to stronger racial identification (preference for interactions within their own racial group) and more negative intergroup emotions, such as feeling anger and fear toward ethnic minorities (Outten et al., 2012). Among other negative effects, racial demographic shift salience triggers stronger explicit and implicit antiminority prejudice (Craig & Richeson, 2014a), social distance towards minorities (Bai & Federico, 2020), discrimination towards racial outgroups (Abascal, 2015), and an expectation among White people that they will become targets of discrimination in the future (Craig & Richeson, 2017).

Actual White Response to Shifting Racial Demographics

In recent years, "white backlash" has been used to delineate White resistance in the push for racial equality, in which White people, imagining themselves on the margins, are held by "violent White nationalism" or advocate for a physical White state through violent means (Dirks, 2022). In moments of racial advancement, journalist Wesley Lowery affirms that America's White majority fears that developments will come at their own expense, and lashes out with rhetoric, policy, and violence (Kaplan, 2023). He further implies that the prediction of America becoming a minority-majority country fuels such extremist behavior.

The year 2023 saw a 50% surge in White supremacy hate groups and a record number of White supremacist propaganda incidents, amounting to a total of 7567 cases (Murray, 2024; Anti-Defamation League, 2024). Coincidentally, such offensive—or one could say, defensive—reactions come at a time when America is imminently approaching a majority-minority population. Ostensibly, White Americans have validated the popular hypothesis: confronted with growing minorities, they experience feelings of threat and hostility, and are in turn motivated to strengthen their societal status (e.g., by reinforcing existing systems that uphold white privilege), even at the expense of racial equality.

It is widely believed that the US Capitol Attack of January 6, 2021, was intended to be an outward assertion of White

dominance in the face of growing and, thus, more powerful minorities. Enraged by the role of the Black vote in cinching Biden's election win, the Capitol insurrectionists had rioted in support of Donald Trump—a politician differentiated by his pro-White sentiments—and were notably united under the rallying cry of "Stop the Steal," in reference to cities with high Black populations that "broke for Biden" (Tensley, 2021). This perceived loss of power and status, in part due to a rising minority with rising societal recognition in the US political system, prompted White Americans to act destructively to defend their historical position as the privileged majority. It is subsequently suggested that the prospective majority-minority US population will not be met peacefully by White Americans (especially those carrying the zero-sum belief that a gain by one group comes at the expense of their own), so long as a greater population size is affiliated with a greater scope of authority, and hence threatening to the conventional White status and its builtin advantages. This conclusion is further validated by research stating that participants in the Capitol attack were more likely to come from areas that experienced more significant declines in the non-Hispanic white population (Jefferson & Ray, 2022).

CONCLUSION

Overall, the examination of White Americans' responses to anticipated and existing racial demographic shifts paints a picture of a fragmented and racially divided future for the United States. Experimental studies suggest that a non-White majority will challenge Whites' current dominance of power and their claim to superior status, eliciting negative emotional responses toward perceived "threats" (e.g., minority groups). This can lead to hostile intergroup relations and an increasingly uncooperative racial climate. Real-life case studies further reinforce these outcomes, illustrating White pushback against the potential loss of societal status, with some individuals even resorting to violence to preserve that status. This paper underscores the importance of understanding the complexities of the White American identity amidst shifting demographics, highlighting the social-psychological factors that both advance and hinder racial relations in 21st-century America.

REFERENCES

- Anti-Defamation League. (2024, March 26). White supremacist propaganda incidents soar record high 2023. https://www.adl. org/resources/press-release/us-white-supremacist-propagandaincidents-reach-historic-levels-2023
- Abascal, M. (2015). Us and Them: Black-White Relations in the Wake of Hispanic Population Growth. American Sociological Review, 80(4), 789-813. https://doi. org/10.1177/0003122415587313
- 3. Administration for Community Living. (2020). 2020 Profile of Older Americans. https://acl.gov/sites/default/files/Aging and Disability in America/2020ProfileOlderAmericans.Final_.pdf
- Bai, H., & Federico, C. M. (2020). Collective existential threat mediates white population decline's effect on defensive reactions. Group Processes & Intergroup Relations, 23(3), 361-377. https://doi.org/10.1177/1368430219839763
- Batalova, J. (2024, March 13). Frequently requested statistics on immigrants and immigration in the United States. Migration Policy Institute. https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/ frequently-requested-statistics-immigrants-and-immigrationunited-states-2024

- Bowdler, J. & Harris, B. (2022, July 21). Racial inequality in the United States. U.S. Department of the Treasury. https://home. treasury.gov/news/featured-stories/racial-inequality-in-theunited-states
- Braveman, P. A., Arkin, E., Proctor, D., Kauh, T., & Holm, N. (2022). Systemic and structural racism: Definitions, examples, health damages, and approaches to dismantling. Health Affairs, 41(2), 171–178. https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2021.01394
- 8. Collins, C. (2018). What is white privilege, really? Learning for Justice. https://www.learningforjustice.org/magazine/fall-2018/what-is-white-privilege-really
- Craig M. A., Richeson J. A. (2014). On the precipice of a "majority-minority" America: Perceived status threat from the racial demographic shift affects White Americans' political ideology. Psychological Science, 25(6), 1189–1197. https://doi. org/10.1177/0956797614527113
- Craig, M. A., & Richeson, J. A. (2017). Information about the US racial demographic shift triggers concerns about anti-White discrimination among the prospective White "minority." PLoS ONE, 12(9), e0185389. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0185389
- 11. Craig, M. A., Rucker, J. M., & Richeson, J. A. (2017). The pitfalls and promise of increasing racial diversity: Threat, contact, and race relations in the 21st Century. Current Directions in Psychological Science, 27(3), 188–193. https://doi.org/10.1177/0963721417727860
- Danbold, F., & Huo, Y. J. (2015). No Longer "All-American"? Whites' Defensive Reactions to Their Numerical Decline. Social Psychological and Personality Science, 6(2), 210-218. https://doi. org/10.1177/1948550614546355
- 13. Dirks, S. (2022, August 16). The unspoken role of race in the Jan. 6 riot. National Public Radio. https://www.npr. org/2022/08/16/1117762232/the-unspoken-role-of-race-in-the-jan-6-rio
- 14. Economic Policy Institute. (2022). Racial and ethnic disparities in the United States: An interactive chartbook. https://www.epi.org/publication/disparities-chartbook/
- 15. Facing History & Ourselves. (2016). Inventing black and white. https://www.facinghistory.org/resource-library/inventing-black-white
- 16. Jefferson, H. & Ray, V. (2022, January 6). White backlash is a type of racial reckoning, too. FiveThirtyEight. https://fivethirtyeight.com/features/white-backlash-is-a-type-of-racial-reckoning-too/
- 17. Kaplan, E. A. (2023, February 7). The 'American Whitelash' Is Far From Over. Politico. https://www.politico.com/news/magazine/2023/07/02/wes-lowery-whitelash-violence-00104438
- 18. Krogstad, J. M., Dunn, A., Passel, J. S. (2021, August 23). Most Americans say the declining share of white people in the U.S. is neither good nor bad for Society. Pew Research Center. https://www.pewresearch.org/short-reads/2021/08/23/most-americans-say-the-declining-share-of-white-people-in-the-u-s-is-neither-good-nor-bad-for-society/
- Major, B., Blodorn, A., & Major Blascovich, G. (2018). The threat of increasing diversity: Why many White Americans support Trump in the 2016 presidential election. Group Processes & Intergroup Relations, 21(6), 931-940. https://doi. org/10.1177/1368430216677304
- McIntsoh, P. (1989) White Privilege: Unpacking the Invisible Knapsack. Peace and Freedom Magazine. https://med.umn. edu/sites/med.umn.edu/files/2022-12/White-Privilege_ McIntosh-1989.pdf
- 21. Moslimani, M. (2024, September 27). What the data says about immigrants in the U.S.. Pew Research Center. https://www.pewresearch.org/short-reads/2024/09/27/key-findings-about-us-immigrants/#:~:text=From%201840%20to%201889%2C%20

- about,%2DHungary%20and%20Russia%2DPoland.
- Murray, A. (2024, June 5). White nationalist, anti-LGBTQ activity
 on the rise, annual hate report shows. Missouri Independent.
 https://missouriindependent.com/2024/06/05/white-nationalistanti-lgbtq-activity-on-the-rise-annual-hate-report-shows/
- Outten H. R., Schmitt M. T., Miller D. A., Garcia A. L. (2012). Feeling threatened about the future: Whites' emotional reactions to anticipated ethnic demographic changes. Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 38, 14–25. https://doi. org/10.1177/0146167211418531
- Oyolola, F. & Batalova, J. (2024, January 11). European immigrants in the United States. Migration Policy Institute. https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/european-immigrantsunited-states-2022
- Pérez E. O. (2021). Diversity's child: People of color and the politics of identity. University of Chicago Press.
- Poston, D. L., Jr. & Bouvier, L. F. (2017). Population and Society: An Introduction to Demography. (2nd ed.). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Poston, D. L., Jr, & Sáenz, R. (2021). Majority to minority: the declining U.S. white population. N-IUSSP. https://www.niussp. org/migration-and-foreigners/majority-minority-declining-u-swhite-population/
- Sáenz, R. & Johnson, K. M. (2016). White Deaths Exceed Deaths in One-Third of U.S. States. Carsey Research, National Issue Brief # 110, Fall, 2016.
- Sidanius J., Pratto F. (1999). Social dominance: An intergroup theory of social hierarchy and oppression. Cambridge University Press
- 30. Tensley, B. (2021, January 13). The US Capitol attack fits into the history of White backlash. Cable News Network. https://edition.cnn.com/2021/01/13/politics/capitol-mob-white-backlash-history/index.html
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2008). 2008 Summary Tables. https://www.census.gov/data/tables/2008/demo/popproj/2008-summary-tables.html
- USA Facts. (2024, November 10). US population by year, race, age, ethnicity, & more. https://usafacts.org/data/topics/peoplesociety/population-and-demographics/our-changing-population/
- Willer, R., Feinberg, M., & Wetts, R. (2016, May 4). Threats to Racial Status Promote Tea Party Support Among White Americans. http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2770186